

Concerning the word 'Paenitentia'
in the works of Tertullian
Article by W.J. Teeuwen
in Mnemosyne II, 55 (1927), pp. 410 to 419
with a personal translation into English interleaved.

DE VOCE „PAENITENTIA” APUD TERTULLIANUM.

SCRIPTIS

St. W. J. TEEUWEN.

Quae sit vis notionis vocis q. e. „paenitentia” apud Tertullianum, lingua hodierna non facile uno verbo reddi potest¹⁾; quin etiam hoc ullo modo fieri posse non videtur, quia haec vox ab eo, nominatim in tractatibus „De paenitentia” et „De pudicitia”, significationibus maxime variatis adhibetur²⁾, ubi simplici versione „boete” vel „bekeering” non satisfit; ita ut in versione v. g. titulus „De paenitentia” melius servetur.

Unum certe constat, vocem q. e. „paenitentia” Tertulliano itemque Christianis eius aetatis nonnisi christiane sonare, qui sonus paganis omnino ignotus erat: „Paenitentiam hoc genus, quod et retro fuimus, cacci, sine domini lumine, natura tenentur”. Sensus enim vulgaris antechristianus, qualis etiamnum in voce graeca *μετάνοια* adest, erat: „sententiam mutare, aliter sentire de actu priore” (neerlandice dicitur „spijt”), quale igitur pagani „etiam in bonis factis adhibent”; Christiani vero paenitentiam tantum ut dolorem erga Deum noverant (neerlandice „berouw”), quae timore domini nixa nonnisi in peccatis adesse poterat: „Dubitandum est, sicut in universis actibus nostris, ita in paenitentiae quoque causa iustitiam deo praestandam esse? Quod quidem ita impleri licebit, si *peccatis*

1) Sic v. g. Kellner titulum „De paenitentia” in priore editione (a. 1882) vertit „Über die Bekehrung”, in altera vero (Kellner-Esser a. 1912) „Über die Busse”.

2) Quare pluribus locis sophismata inveniuntur, in quibus Tertullianus hoc uno eodemque verbo significatione diversa utitur.

solummodo adhibeatur... Quodsi non delinquit¹⁾, cur *paenitentiam* invadit, *delinquentium privatam*?”

Vocis „paenitentia” igitur, transeuntis e sermone communi in sermonem christianum, significatio restricta est, cum tamen simul notio „boni” ibi sentiatur²⁾. Simul tamen aliud quid accedit, quod notioni doloris etiam sensum concomitantem addat: Ubi enim Tertullianus dicit: „(populum Judaicum) ingrattissimum tollens expertus (dominus) ad *paenitentiam* semper hortatus est”, ibi domini mens non solum haec est: Iudaei de peccatis suis paenitentiam agant, doleant quod peccaverunt; quin potius, respiciens quod ante e S. Mattheo (III, 1) laudavit („paenitentiam innotet”³⁾), indicat: e peccatis surgant et *se ad Deum convertant*. Qui sensus concomitans: conversio peccatoris, („emendatio”), a sensu christiano doloris sciungi non potest, nam „Ubi metus nullus, emendatio proinde nulla; ubi emendatio nulla, paenitentia necessario vana”. Quin etiam emendatio (conversio) summa est paenitentiae, ita ut hic sensus concomitans fiat sensus praecipuus, et vox „paenitentia” synonyma fiat „pristinorum renuntiationis”, sive dicitur de peccatore sensu generali (conversio⁴⁾ ad Deum), sive de „converso” sensu stricto, de transitu ad Christianismum: „Hoc enim dico, paenitentiam... semel cognitam atque susceptam *nunquam* pesthac iteratione delicti *resignari* oportere”; quod verbis positivis sic dicitur: „ad paenitentiam semel (neerlandice „eens voor al”) capessendam et *perpetuo continendam*”. Utrumque dictum est „nunquam resignari” et „perpetuo continendam” indicant notionem doloris recedere et tantummodo ob oculos versari sensum praecipuum q. e. „conversio”.

Notio autem adaequata paenitentiae non semper tantum

1) „Delinquere” et „delictum” apud Tertullianum plerumque ut et hoc loco christiane sonant: peccare, peccata.

2) Cfr.: „Malo enim ad miseriam pervenitur; sed *ubi paenitendum est, desinit miserum, quia factum est salutare*” (paen. 10).

3) Conferatur textus Vulgatae: Evang. sec. Marcum 1, 15: „*Poenitemini, et credite Evangelio*”; Actus Apostolorum 3, 19: „*Poenitemini igitur, et concertimini ut deleantur peccata vestra*”.

4) „Vivo, inquit dominus, et *paenitentiam* malo quam mortem” (paen. 4) Cfr. „Nolo mortem peccatoris, sed ut magis *convertatur et vivat*”.

Concerning the word "Paenitentia"
is the works of Tertullien.

by

St. W.J. Teeuwen.

The force of the meaning of the word "paenitentia" in the writings of Tertullien cannot easily be rendered in one word in the language of today; 1. indeed it does not seem possible for this to be done in any way at all, because he uses this word with very varied meanings, particularly in the treatises "De paenitentia" and "De pudicitia", 2. where he is not satisfied with the simple version "boete" or "bekeering"; so therefore is this version, for example, the title "De paenitentia" is better kept.

One thing is certainly agreed, that to Tertullien and likewise to Christians of that age the word 'paenitentia' has only Christian overtones, which were altogether unknown to the pagans: "They in their blindness and without the light of the Lord, as we were formerly, know what kind of thing paenitentia is up to a certain point by nature." For the popular pre-Christian sense was such as is still present in the greek word "to change one's opinion, to feel differently about a previous action" (in Dutch one says "spijt"), hence therefore the pagans "exhibit it also in their good deeds"; but Christians recognised paenitentia only as grief (remorse directed) towards God (in Dutch "berouw) which springing from fear of the Lord could only be present in (the concept of) sin: "Can we doubt that, even as in all our actions, so also in the case of paenitentia, justice is due to God?"

This indeed can be fulfilled in this way only if it is applied to sins/

But if one does not sin, 1. why write paenitentia is proper only to sinners?"

Therefore the meaning of the word "paenitentia" when transferred from common language into Christian language is restricted, since at once the notion of "good" is perceived there. 2. But at the same time there is an additional factor which adds an accompanying feeling of grief to the meaning: For when Tertullien says: "(the Lord) finding (the people of Judoea) most ungrateful on many occasions always exhorted them to paenitentia", there the intention of the Lord is not only this: Let the Judoeans do paenitentia for their sins, let them grieve because they have sinned; many rather looking back to what he praised before from St. Matthew III, ("enter (into a state of) paenitentia") 3. he declares: let them arise from their sins and turn towards God. This accompanying sense: the conversion (literally turning) of the sinner ("improvement") cannot be separated from the Christian meaning of grief, for, "when there is no fear, then there is no improvement; when there is no improvement, paenitentia is necessarily vain (empty)". Indeed also improvement (conversion) is the main point in paenitentia, so that this accompanying sense becomes the special (chief) sense, and the word "paenitentia" becomes synonymous with "renunciation of former things", whether one is speaking about the sinner in a general sense (conversion 4. to God), or about "converted" in a strict sense, about passing over to Christianity: "For I say this, that paenitentia...once recognised and undertaken ought never to be given up afterwards by repetition of the sin"; and this is expressed positively as follows: "there must be an assumption of paenitentia once and for all (in Dutch "eens voor al") and it must be always maintained". Each saying both "never given up" and "always maintained" indicate the idea of grief receding and only the special sense of "conclusion" staying before ones eyes. /

1. So for example Kellner changes the title "De paenitentia" in the former edition (1882) to "Uber die Bekehrung", and in another edition indeed (Kellner - Essex 1912) to "Uber die Busse".

2. Wherefore in many places sophisms are found in which Tertullien uses this one and the same word with diverse meanings.

1. "Delinquere" and "delictum" in the works of Tertullien mostly as here have the Christian connotations of "peccare" and "peccata".

2. Compare: "For through evil one comes to unhappiness; but when there has to be "paenitentia", unhappiness ceases, because the act (of paenitentia) heals". (paen 10).

3. Compare the text of the Vulgate: St. Mark's Gospel 1,15: "Repent and believe in the gospel"; Acts of the Apostles 3,19: "Repent therefore and be converted so that your sins may be blotted out".

4. "I live, said the Lord and I prefer paenitentia to death" (paen 4) Compare "I do not want the death of a sinner, but rather for him to be converted and live".

„conversio” est, sed huic significationi statim alter sensus concomitans adiungitur, prout de catechumenis aut de peccatoribus baptizatis agitur. Ubi enim Tertullianus in capite VI tractatus „De paenitentia” speciatim catechumenos adloquitur, ibi statim de baptismo instanti cogitatur. Tertullianus paenitentiam catechumenorum cum nummo comparat, quo in baptismo remissio peccatorum acquiritur; deinde dicit: „Si ergo qui venditant prius numum quo paciscuntur examinant, ne scalptus neve rarus, ne adulter, etiam dominum credimus paenitentiae probationem prius inire”: ita etiam deum puto examinare, num quid paenitentiae desit. Illic paenitentia igitur amplius significat quam conversionem; quid enim aliud deesse potest catechumenis, qui vitae ante actae renuntiantes sese converterint? Tertullianum audiamus dicentem: „Quicquid ergo mediocritas nostra ad paenitentiam semel capessendam et perpetuo continendam suggerere conata est, omnes quidem deditos domino spectat, ... sed praecipue novitiolis istis imminet, qui... dicunt quidem pristinis renuntiare et paenitentiam assumunt, sed includere eam neglegunt”.

Quid hic sibi vult „paenitentiam includere”? ¹⁾ Oehlerus illud dictum interpretatur verbis „sel. baptismo”, quasi verba „paenitentiam includere neglegunt” significent „nondum baptizari volunt”; quam interpretationem non esse veram apparet e toto capite, in quo Tertullianus eandem sententiam positive et negative variis modis exprimit. Quae hic de catechumenis dicit: „paenitentiam includere neglegunt” alio loco v. g. „cunctationem et tergiversationem erga paenitentiam” vocat. Si supra dicta interpretatio Oehlerii vera esset, etiam hic „cunctatio et tergiversatio” dilationem baptismi indicaret ²⁾ et ideo „paenitentia” „baptismus” esset. Quod ipsa verba continuis insequentia „praesumptio intinctionis” vetant; praesertim cum animadvertimus, quomodo Tertullianus postea sensum horum verborum lato explicet.

Ii catechumeni enim, quos Tertullianus spectat, non vere

1) *Includere* hic idem valet quod „perficere”, quo sensu etiam „adimplere, implere” adhibetur, cum „assumere” nonnisi „incipere” significet.

2) Neque verbis „Differamus tantisper paenitentiae veritatem” directe dilatio baptismi denotatur.

paenitentiam agunt, et putant se ei iam satisfecisse, quod „inter auditorum tirocinia deputantur, quasi eo etiam nunc sibi delinquere liceat”. Potius post conversionem ad Christianismum vitam sine peccatis agere assuescant, et ita paenitentiam suam (= conversionem) perfectam reddant („paenitentiam includere”). Iam ante baptismum enim catechumenos peccare desiisse oportebat, nam „non ideo abluimur ut delinquere desinamus, sed quia *desimus*, quoniam iam corde loti sumus; haec enim prima audientis intinctio est, *metus integer*”. Ob id ipsam autem, quod in baptismo omnia peccata remittantur, putant usque ad illud tempus etiam peccare sibi licere, et „commeatum sibi faciunt delinquendi quam eruditionem non delinquendi”. Cumque hi catechumeni dicunt: „Differamus tantisper paenitentiae veritatem” ¹⁾, ipsa „praesumptio intinctionis”, ipsa certitudo se in baptismo remissionem peccatorum esse adepturos („certi enim indubitatae veniae delictorum”), iis fit causa, cur ad tempus „veram paenitentiam”, plenam conversionem atque cordis renovationem differant: „Omne praeterca cunctationis et tergiversationis erga *paenitentiam* vitium praesumptio intinctionis importat”.

Hoc loco igitur vox „paenitentia” alium habet sensum: est paenitentia catechumenorum, est eorum „paenitentia vera”. Cum Tertullianus catechumenum-peccatorem, qui „assumit quidem paenitentiam, sed includere eam neglegit”, „hominem infidae paenitentiae” dicat, catechumenus „verae paenitentiae” is catechumenus est, cui „displicet malo esse”, „qui sponte innocentiam induit” et „delectatur a crimine vacare”, denique „quae conscientia semel paenitentiam amplexatus est”. Ipse hic animus a peccatis alienus, quem Tertullianus christiane „metum” ²⁾

1) „Paenitentiae veritas” (= paenitentia vera) hic non ut Esser putat (B. K. V. I, 235) actiones paenitentiae consuetas ante baptismum spectat, de quibus in hoc tractatu „De paenitentia” omnino sermo non fit (fit vero v. g. in „De oratione” 20. Cfr. infra. p. 415³⁾). Totus contextus tantum perfectionem paenitentiae indicat, quae talis esse debeat, ut postquam quis catechumenus factus sit, vitam sine peccatis agere pergat.

2) „Metus integer” igitur synonymus est cum „desinere peccare”. Cfr.: „Le catéchuménat était un stage pendant lequel les convertis apprenaient leurs devoirs essentiels de croyance et de conduite, en même temps qu'ils s'exerçaient à les pratiquer” (Duchesne, Origines du culte chrétien 1889, p. 291).

but to this meaning another accompanying sense is added in connection with new converts or baptised sinners. For when Tertullien in Chapter VI of the treatise "De paenitentia" addresses new converts specifically, there immediately he is thinking about the approaching baptism. Tertullien compares the "paenitentia" of new converts with a coin by which in baptism remission of sins is obtained; then he says: "If therefore those who are trying to make a sale first examine the money which is being paid to make the contract, whether the man be marked or shaven (i.e. a slave) or an adulterer, we believe that the Lord also first embarks on a test of "paenitentia" is complete). Here therefore "paenitentia" means more than conversion; for what else can new converts lack, who have renounced their previous life and been converted? Let us listen to Tertullien who says: "Therefore our moderation (of our ways) for the purpose of assuming "paenitentia" once and for all and always maintaining it, whatever it aimed to bring about, it applies to all those indeed who have dedicated themselves to the hard,.....but especially it hangs over those novices, who... say indeed that they renounce their former life and assume "paenitentia", but neglect to include it".

What does he mean here by "to include paenitentia"? 1. Oehlerus interprets that saying by the words "namely by baptism", as if the words "they neglect to include "paenitentia" mean "they do not wish to be baptised yet"; it is clear that this interpretation is not true from the whole chapter in which Tertullien expounds the same opinion both positively and negatively in various ways. What he says here about the new converts: "they neglect to include "paenitentia", is another place he calls "hesitation and reluctance with regard to paenitentia". If the above interpretation of Oehlerus were true, here also "hesitation and reluctance" would indicate a postponement of baptism 2. and therefore "paenitentia" would be "baptism". But the very words which follow 'presumption of immersion' forbid this interpretation; especially when we notice how Tertullian later unfolds the meaning of these words at length.

do 'paenitentia', and they think they have already satisfied him because "they are selected among the recruited pupils, as if they are now allowed to sin right up to that point". Rather, after conversion to Christianity they should become accustomed to leading their lives without sin, and thus should offer up their 'paenitentia' (= conversion) complete (perfected) ("to include paenitentia'). For already before baptism new converts ought to stop sinning, for "we are not thus washed clean in order that we may cease to sin, but because we have (already) ceased, since we have already been cleansed in our hearts; for this is the first immersion (literally a 'dipping in' - it suggests being totally imbued with) of the pupil, a genuine (complete) fear." But on account of that very fact that in baptism all sins will be remitted, they think that they can sin right up to that time, and "they keep sinning continuously rather than trying to learn not to sin." And when these new converts say: "Let us delay the reality of 'paenitentia' meanwhile", 1. the very "presumption of immersion", that certainty that they will obtain remission of their sins in baptism ("for they are sure of the undoubted forgiveness of sins"), these became the reason why they should postpone till the appropriate time "true paenitentia", their full conversion and the renewal of their hearts: "Moreover presumption of immersion causes every vice of delay and reluctance with regard to "paenitentia".

In this place therefore the word "paenitentia" has another meaning: it is the "paenitentia" of new converts, it is their "true paenitentia". Since Tertullien speaks of a new convert-sinner, who "indeed assumes (begins of note (1)pg.412 paenitentia, but neglects to include it", "a man of untrue paenitentia", the new convert of "true paenitentia" is that new convert to whom "it is displeasing to be evil", "who of his own accord clothes himself in innocence" and "takes delight in being free from wrong-doing" and finally "who has embraced "paenitentia" once and for all is his conscience". This spirit itself which is a stranger to sin, which Tertullien (speaking) in Christian terms calls "fear" 2.

1. 'Includere' here means the same as "to achieve", to which sense is added also "to fulfil", "to perform", since "to assume" means only "to begin".
2. Nor is a postponement of baptism directly denoted in the words "Meanwhile let us delay the reality of "paenitentia".

1. "The reality of paenitentia" (= true "paenitentia") here does not as Esser thinks (B.K. V. 1, 235) apply to the customary actions of "paenitentia" before baptism, concerning which there is no discussion at all in the treatise "De paenitentia". (There is a discussion in "De oratione" 20. Compare below pg.415/3). The whole context indicates only a completion of "paenitentia", which ought to be such that afterwards whoever has become
↳ a new convert proceeds to live his life without sin.
2. "Genuine fear" therefore is synonymous with "to stop sinning". Compare: The 'catechunerat' was a stage during which converts learned their essential lessons of belief and of behaviour, at the same time as they tried to exercise them in practice". (Duchesne, Origins of the Christian religion 1889, pg. 281).
↳

vocat, in baptizandis omnino requiritur eorumque paenitentiam „veram” reddit („instrumentum paenitentiae, id est metus”); quare hanc paenitentiam veram etiam „metum integrum” dicere potest. Qui hunc metum non habet, eius paenitentia non est perfecta, et ideo in eo non est talis animus, qui eum ad baptismum admitti sinat: „Quem censeas digniorem nisi emendatiorem? quem emendatiorem, nisi timidiorem, et ideo *vera paenitentia functum?*”

Quae paenitentia non baptizati igitur („paenitentia ante fidem”) continet ea quae in catechumeno ad baptismum requiruntur; si autem reputamus, Tertulliano eiusque aetati notionem „baptismi” fere idem sonuisse quod „remissionis peccatorum”¹⁾, notionem paenitentiae etiam his verbis enuntiare possumus: ea, quae in catechumenis ad remissionem peccatorum requiruntur. Quamobrem Tertullianus: „Quam porro ineptum quam *paenitentiam* non adimplere, et *veniam delictorum* sustinere”... „Hoc enim pretio dominus *veniam* addicere instituit; hac *paenitentiae* compensatione redimendam proponit impunitatem”.

Quamquam autem baptismus potissimum peccata remittere putabatur, tamen etiam post baptismum peccata remitti poterant. Tertullianus vitam hominum navigationi, quae ad vitam aeternam instituitur, comparat: navis, qua in portum salutis navigari potest, est baptismus (i. e. remissio peccatorum, quae fit in baptismo). Christianum, qui post baptismum denuo peccat (quod vocat „baptismum amittere”), naufrago comparat, cui in fluctus peccatorum lapso una tantum spes salutis superest in tabula paenitentiae: „Eam (scilicet paenitentiam) tu peccator... ita invade, ita amplexare, ut naufragus alicuius tabulae fidem. Haec te peccatorum fluctibus mersum prolevabit et in portum divinae clementiae protelabit”.

Ut ante baptismum (paenitentia ante fidem) ita etiam post baptismum paenitentia ad remissionem peccatorum remanebat (paenitentia post fidem). Tametsi baptizato hoc verbum aliud sonabat ac catechumeno, tamen utrique idem valebat ac: ea

1) v. g. „Haec igitur venena eius (scilicet diaboli) providens deus, clausa licet *ignoscantiae* ianua et (= scilicet) *intinctionis* sera obstructa, aliquid adhuc permisit latere” (paen. 7). (Cfr. Teeuwen, Bedeutungswandel bei Tertullian p. 78/79.

quae requiruntur ad veniam. Quare haec altera ratio remissionis peccatorum¹⁾ etiam „paenitentia secunda” dicitur: „Clausa licet ignocentiae ianua et (= scilicet) intinctionis sera obstructa, aliquid adhuc permisit latere. Collocavit in vestibulo *paenitentiam secundam*, quae pulsantibus patefaciat”. Ritus enim universus reconciliationis peccatoris, quae fit post baptismum, simillima erat initiationi baptizandorum. Peccator enim baptismum amisisse putabatur, quem nunc recuperare conatur; alter quidam catechumenatus ei erat peragendus²⁾, itaque et altera paenitentia, cuius eventus quidem erat idem (venia delictorum), cuius tamen ambitus diversus: „Huius igitur *paenitentiae secundae* et unius quanto in arto negotium est, tanto operosior probatio, ut *non sola conscientia* praefatur, sed *aliquo etiam actu* administretur. Is actus, qui magis Graeco vocabulo exprimitur et frequentatur, exomologesis est”.

Expressis igitur verbis enuntiat hanc paenitentiam secundam aliam esse ac paenitentiam-ante-baptismum, de qua paulo ante verba fecit. Discrimen enim in eo est, quod paenitentia secunda praeter conscientiam actum etiam exteriorem continet, qui dicitur exomologesis (paenitentiae actiones publicae). Etiam ante baptismum licet actiones quaedam paenitentiae praeciperentur³⁾, eae tamen non peragebantur nisi postquam quis iam dignus iudicatus est qui baptizaretur⁴⁾; praeparatio tantum proxima erant baptismi, ideoque omnibus caedem. Exomologesis autem alii peccatori alia erat pro gravitate peccatorum, et omnino necessaria erat ad remissionem peccatorum conse-

1) Cfr. „Piget *secundas*, immo iam ultimae *spei* (= *spei veniae*) subtexere mentionem, ne retractantes de *residuo auxilio paenitendi* spatium adhuc delinquendi demonstrare videamur” (paen. 7).

2) Duchesne, Origines du culte chrétien p. 421. Cfr.: „secunda te paenitentia excipiet; *cris iterum* de *mocho christianus*” (pudic. 10).

3) „Ingressuros baptismum orationibus crebris, ieiuniis et geniculationibus et pervigiliis orare oportet et cum confessione omnium retro delictorum, ut exponat etiam baptismum Ioannis” (orat. 20).

4) „Si le catéchumène désirait compléter son initiation et si les chefs de l'église le jugeaient digne de recevoir le baptême, il passait dans la classe des élus ou compétents.... Pendant la sainte quarantaine, ils devaient se présenter souvent à l'église pour subir les exorcismes et entendre les instructions préparatoires au baptême” (Duchesne, Origines p. 282).

is considered absolutely necessary in those who are to be baptised and represents their "true" "paenitentia" ("the instrument of 'paenitentia', that is fear"); therefore one can say that this true 'paenitentia' is also "genuine fear". The 'paenitentia' of the one who does not have this fear is not complete, and so he does not have within him the sort of spirit which allows him to be admitted to baptism: "Whom would you consider worthier than the more fearful, and therefore the performer of true paenitentia"?

This paenitentia" of the unbaptised man therefore ("paenitentia before faith") contains these elements which are demanded for baptism in the new convert; but if we consider that to Tertullien and to his age the notion of 'baptism' meant almost the same as the notion of "the remission of sins" 1, we can express the notion of 'paenitentia' also in these words: those elements which are demanded in new converts for the remission of sins. And so Tertullien (says): "How foolish it is then not to complete this paenitentia and establish forgiveness of sins"....."For the Lord resolved to award forgiveness at this price; he offered to give freedom from punishment as the compensation for paenitentia"

But although baptism was thought to remit sins best, nevertheless sins could also be remitted after baptism. Tertullien compares the life of men to a voyage, embarked on towards eternal life: the ship in which one can sail into the harbour of safety (salvation?) is baptism (i.e. the remission of sins, which comes about in baptism). He compares the Christian who sins again after baptism (which he calls "to let baptism slip") to one who has been shipwrecked, whose one and only hope of safety once he has fallen into the waves of sin is on the raft of "paenitentia": "You, sinner, undertake it (namely paenitentia), embrace it thus, even as the one who has been shipwrecked puts his trust in some raft. This will raise you up when you have sunk among the waves of sin and carry you into the harbour of divine clemency".

As/

Therefore this other method for the remission of sins 1. is also called "second paenitentia": "Although the door of forgiveness is closed and the bolt of immersion (in the faith) is securely fastened, he still allowed something to be concealed (lie hidden). He placed in the entrance "second paenitentia" which he makes accessible to those who knock (on the door)". For the whole ceremony of the reconciliation of the sinner which happens after baptism, was very similar to the initiation of those to be baptised. For the sinner was thought to have let slip (the benefits of) baptism, which now he is trying to recover; he had to go through another catechism 2., and therefore another 'paenitentia', of which the result was indeed the same (forgiveness of performance of this second and single paenitentia is difficult just as the examination is more laborious so that not only conscience is to be shown, but also there must be a performance of some action. That action, which is expressed and repeated more frequently is greek, is exomologesis" (i.e. full confession).

In these words therefore it is expressed that this second 'paenitentia' is different from paenitentia-before-baptism which he described a little earlier. For there is a distinction in that second 'paenitentia' involves an exterior action also apart from conscience, which is called full confession (the actions of public paenitentia) (or this can read 'the public actions of 'paenitentia'). Also before baptism although certain actions of 'paenitentia' were prescribed 3., nevertheless they were not accomplished until after anyone was judged worthy to be baptised 4.; they were only the preparation nearest to baptism, and therefore the same for all. But full confession was different for one sinner and another in accordance with the gravity of the sins, and was entirely necessary for obtaining remission of sins.

1. Compare "it is shameful to make mention of second (paenitentia), yea, of what is now the last hope (= hope of forgiveness), lest drawing back from the remaining help of repenting we seem to point out an interval still for sinning" (paen.7).

2./

As before baptism (paenitentia before faith), so also after baptism paenitentia for the remission of sins remained (paenitentia after faith). Although this word sounded different to the baptised man and the new convert, nevertheless it had the same force for each: those elements which are required for pardon.

1. For example "Therefore God, foreseeing these poisons of him (namely the devil) although the door of forgiveness be closed, and the bolt of immersion (in the faith) be securely fastened, he still allowed something to be concealed" (paen. 7) (If Teeuwen, Bedeutungswandel bei Tertullien p. 78/79.)

2. Duchesne, Origins of the Christian religion p. 421. Compare: "Second paenitentia will receive you; you will again be a Christian after being an adulterer". (pudic 10).

3. "Those about to enter baptism ought to pray with repeated supplications, fastings and genicularions and vigils, and with a confession of all their past sins, as he expounds the baptism of John" (orat. 20).

4. "If the new convert desired to complete his initiation and if the leaders of the church deemed him worthy of receiving baptism, he passed into the class of the chosen or suitable..... During the holy forty-day period, they had to present themselves often at the church to undergo exorcisms and to hear teaching preparatory to baptism." (Duchesne, Origins p. 282).

quendam. Peccatori non prius communicatio ecclesiastica restitui poterat quam episcopus et sacerdotes et populus actiones paenitentiae satis peractas iudicaverant.

Qui graecismus „exomologesis” apud Tertullianum raro admodum invenitur, et id quidem praesertim cum in „De paenitentia” de actionibus paenitentiae verba facit. In graeciam ecclesiae lingua haec vox in terminum technicum evaluerat, quo indicabantur actiones peccatoris paenitentis post baptismum, et eae quidem publicae ab ecclesia impositae: „Itaque exomologesis *prosterndi et humiliificandi hominis disciplina est*”; „*Castigatio victus atque cultus*”. Quae sunt eae actiones, quibus quis erga Deum de facto se peccatorem constituit: „Is actus... exomologesis est, qua delictum domino nostrum confitemur” (= manifestamus). Simul tamen indirecte etiam accusatio sui ipsius est adversus alios Christianos, ita ut facile intelligatur „plerosque *hoc opus ut publicationem sui aut suffugere aut de die in diem differre*”. Quae paenitentia publica iis peccatoribus, quorum peccata quae dicebantur mortalia suppliciiis aeternis digna erant, iniungebatur tamquam necessaria ad reconciliationem cum Deo impetrandam („ut deum reconciliem mihi”¹⁾). Quamobrem Tertullianus, postquam nos monuit, quomodo ii, „qui ambitu obeunt capessendi magistratus” omnia sustineant „in causa votorum suorum”, peccatores, quorum „vota” essent venia peccatorum, ad illos inuitandos exhortatur dicens: „Nos, quod securium virgarumve petitio sustinet, *in periculo aeternitatis tolerare dubitamus? et castigationem victus atque cultus offenso domino praestare cessabimus?*”

Quod igitur peccatori in exomologesi ante oculos versabatur, erat venia peccatorum, quam paenitentia peracta sperare posset: „Cum igitur provolvit hominem, magis relevat; cum squalidum facit, magis *mundatum reddit*; cum accusat, *excusat*; cum condemnat, *absolvit*”. Dicta qualia sunt: „gehennam... exomologesis *extinguet*, „aeterna supplicia... *expunget*” e. a. ostendunt his paenitentiae actionibus talem valorem tribui, ut eae pec-

1) Cfr. „Peccator restituendo sibi institutam a domino exomologesin scierit praeteribit illam?” (paen. 12).

catori imprimis necessariae esse viderentur. Ita etiam intellegi potest, quae sit Tertulliani mens dicentis: „adversus gehennam post prima illa intinctionis dominicae munimenta *esse adhuc in exomologesi secunda subsidia*”. Quibus nempe verbis Tertullianus non dicit post baptismum actiones paenitentiae per semetipsas vim remissionis habere; nam vox „exomologesis” hic non sensu stricto adhibetur, sed ut pars pro toto eodem sensu quo paenitentia secunda usurpatur, complectens ea omnia quae post baptismum ad remissionem requiruntur. Quod apparet e textu parallelo supra laudato, quo eadem his verbis dicuntur: „Clausula licet ignoscentiae ianua et *intinctionis sera obstructa*, aliquid adhuc permisit latere. Collocavit in vestibulo paenitentiam secundam”. Utrumque hunc textum idem¹⁾ dicere manifestum est, ita ut vox „exomologesis” hic per synecdochen sensu latiore ut paenitentia secunda adhibeatur.

Non tamen haec argumentatio convertenda est ita ut dicatur: in textu posteriore paenitentiam sensum strictiorem exomologeseos accepisse. Quamquam enim „paenitentia” apud Tertullianum saepius ita sumitur, hic tamen fieri non potest, imprimis ob haec verba: „aliquo *etiam* actu (= exomologesi) administratur”. Exomologesis itaque non nisi pars paenitentiae est; ipsa ea paenitentia has actiones paenitentiae secum affert: „Pariter *de paenitentiae officio* sedent in sacco et cinere inhorrescunt”; „*ex paenitentia* fientes et ieiunantes, et adflictionem suam offerentes deo”. Qua de re Tertullianus relationem paenitentiam inter et exomologesin — utpote totum eiusque partem — indicat his verbis: „Paenitentia et ministerium eius exomologesis”.

Ut iam supra indicatum est, ita etiam ex his verbis „ministerium eius” apparet, has actiones peccatori non simpliciter partem paenitentiae sed partem praecipuam esse. Sicut in paenitentia catechumenorum res praecipua erat timor domini („*instrumentum* paenitentiae, id est *metus*”), ita in paenitentia secunda pars praecipua erant actiones paenitentiae („paenitentia et *ministerium* eius exomologesis”). Nil mirum ergo Tertullianum, ubi in tractatu „De Paenitentia” de utroque hoc

1) Cfr. „Maculas carnis post baptismum respersae paenitentia dilui posse” (pudic. 12).

The communion of the Church was not able to be restored to the sinner before the bishop and priests and people had judged that the actions of paenitentia had been satisfactorily performed.

This graecism "exomologesis" (full confession) is found only rarely in the works of Tertullien, and that indeed especially when he writes in "De paenitentia" about the actions of "paenitentia". New in the Greek language of the church this meaning had acquired a strong technical sense by which were indicated the actions of the penitent sinner after baptism, and these were imposed publicly by the church: "Therefore exomologesis (full confession) is the discipline whereby a man becomes suppliant and humble, "It is the punishment of our way of living and cult". These are those actions by which anyone showed himself to be an actual sinner towards God: "That action.....is exomologesis, by which we confess our sin to the Lord" (= we reveal). At the same time however it is also indirectly an indictment of himself in front of other Christians, so that it is easily understood why "several men evade this task of making themselves notorious or delay it from day to day". For those sinners whose sins, which were said to be mortal were worthy of eternal punishment, this public 'paenitentia' was imposed as if it were necessary for achieving a reconciliation with God ("in order that I may reconcile God to myself")¹. Therefore after Tertullien has reminded us how those "who engage in canvassing to obtain magisterial office" do everything "in the cause of winning votes for themselves", he exhorts sinners, whose "votes" are forgiveness of sins, to imitate them, saying: "Do we, when in eternal danger hesitate to endure what the candidate for axes and rods (carried by Pictors who attended the Roman consuls .'. a symbol of supreme power) does? And shall we delay undergoing the punishment of our way of life and cult when we have offended the Lord?"

Therefore the thing which dwelt before the eyes of the sinner is full confession was forgiveness of sins, which he could hope for once paenitentia was performed: "Although therefore it throws a man down, it raises him/

So also it can be understood what was Tertullien's intention when he said: "Against (the threat of) Hell after those first defences of immersion (in belief) in the Lord there is still a second means of help in full confession." By these words Tertullien certainly does not say that after baptism the actions of paenitentia of themselves have power of remission; for the word "exomologesis" is not applied here in the strict sense, but as part in place of the whole in the same sense in which second 'paenitentia' is used, embracing all those things which are required for remission after baptism. This is clear from the parallel text praised above, in which the same things are said in the following words: "Although the door of forgiveness be closed and the bolt of immersion securely fastened, he still (reading adhuc not adhus - of previous quotation pg 414) allowed something to be concealed. He placed second paenitentia in the entrance". It is plain that each of these texts says the same thing 1. that the word "exomologesis" (full confession) here through synecdoche (= figure of speech by which a part is used for the whole) is applied in a wider sense as second paenitentia.

However this argument must not be altered in such a way that it says: in the later text paenitentia has received a stricter sense than exomologesis. For although in the writings of Tertullien "paenitentia" is more often taken thus, here on the other hand it cannot be, especially on account of the following words: "It is managed also by some action (= full confession)". Full confession therefore is only a part of paenitentia; that paenitentia itself brings these actions of paenitentia with it: "Equally in performing the duty of paenitentia they sit and tremble in sackcloth and ashes"; "weeping and fasting in paenitentia, and offering their distress to God".

Concerning this matter - the relation between paenitentia and exomologesis - inasmuch as it is the whole and part of it - Tertullien indicates in the following words: "Paenitentia and its assistance (servant) exomologesis" (full confession).

As has already been indicated above, so also from these words "its assistance (assistant, servant), it is clear that/

416 ~~him~~^{up}/the more; although it makes him dirty, it restores him more cleansed; although it accuses, it excuses; although it condemns, it acquits". Quotations such as the following: "full confession will extinguish Gehenna (Hell) , it will blot out eternal punishment" both show that such value is attributed to these actions of paenitentia that they seemed to be especially necessary for the sinner.

1. Compare: "Shall the sinner when restoring himself omit knowingly that full confession which was instituted by the Lord? " (paen 12)

that for the sinner these actions are not simply part of paenitentia but a special part. Even as in the paenitentia of new converts the special thing was fear of the Lord ("the instrument of paenitentia, that is fear"), so in second paenitentia the special part was the actions of paenitentia (paenitentia and its assistant exomologesis)" (full confession). Therefore there is nothing remarkable about the fact that when Tertullien discusses at length each of these kinds of paenitentia in the treatise "De Paenitentia", while treating /

1. Compare: The stains of the flesh besprinkled after baptism can be washed away by paenitentia" (pudic 12)

12
 genere paenitentiae copiose disserit tractantem de paenitentia. ante-fidem quaestionem actionum paenitentiae omnino relinquere (quamquam et ante baptismum tales actiones non deerant), sed tantum de „emendatione” agere. Ubi rursus venit ad agendum de paenitentia secunda, iam nonnisi de exomologesi loquitur, quippe quae res praecipua sit, quamquam ad remissionem peccatorum etiam alia requirebantur¹⁾. Quod ergo catechumeno „metus” valebat, id peccatori actus paenitentiae, nempe summa paenitentiae et sicut in illo notio „paenitentiae” magis animum interiorem exprimit, ita in hoc praecipue actus exteriores. Quare, sicut vox „paenitentia” in catechumeno praegnanter „metum” significare potest, ita in peccatore actum paenitentiae. Quo sensu saepius a Tertulliano usurpatur speciatim in tractatu „De pudicitia”, in qua de sola paenitentia secunda loquitur, et remissionem peccatorum denegans ecclesiae eam soli Deo, cui paenitentia agatur, tribuit²⁾: pro exomologesi ibi simpliciter „paenitentiam” dicit.

In tractatu „De paenitentia” etiam Tertullianus putat omnium peccatorum veniam paenitentiae nomine concedi posse (quamquam semel tantum³⁾) et eum, qui postea in peccata capitalia relapsus sit, „paenitentiam perdere”, q. e. eum non iam in communicationem restitui posse. At in tractatu „De pudicitia” etiam peccata quaedam inremissibilia ponit, quorum igitur paenitentia omnis, utpote venia carens⁴⁾, inanis esse videtur. Nihilominus etiam peccatori, qui veniam consequi non posset, paenitentia agenda erat. Hanc ei ecclesia imponebat, non vero quod crederet eum in damnationem aeternam esse iturum, sed

1) v. g. „Quid enim ex paenitentia maturescit quam emendationis effectus? sed etsi venia potius est paenitentiae fructus, hanc quoque consistere non licet sine cessatione delicti. Ita *cessatio delicti* radix est veniae, ut venia sit paenitentiae fructus” (pudic. 10). Cfr.: „ut non sola *conscientia* praefertur, sed aliquo etiam actu administretur” (paen. 9).

2) „Nos, qui solum dominum meminimus delicta concedere, et utique mortalia” (pudic. 3).

3) „Sed iam semel, quia iam secundo, sed *amplius nunquam*, quia proxime frustra” (paen. 7); „Huius igitur paenitentiae secundae et *unius*” (paen. 9).

4) „(Paenitentia) alia erit, quae *veniam* consequi possit, in delicto scilicet remissibili, alia quae *consequi nullo modo possit, in delicto scilicet inremissibili*” (paen. 2).

ut eum pro meritis castigaret; nam etsi „pacem hic non metit, apud dominum seminat; nec amittit, sed praeparat fructum” (np. veniam)... Ita nec paenitentia (= castigatio victus atque cultus) huiusmodi vana, nec disciplina eiusmodi dura est”.

Haec notio castigationis (neerl. boete), quam inde ab initio in verbo „paenitentia” fuisse vidimus, cum hoc verbo, usque ad nostram aetatem, coniuncta permansit. Unde, quia id, quod nostris temporibus „peccatorum confessio” dicitur, apud Tertullianum imprimis actiones paenitentiae continebat, ob id ipsum tunc pro hac re non vox „confessio” (ut nunc fit) sed „paenitentia” usurpabatur. Cum inde ab aetate Augustini actiones publicae paenitentiae paulatim recederent et maius momentum confessioni orali tribueretur, tunc demum vox „paeniteri” terminus technicus facta est¹⁾, et vox „paenitentia” indicabat castigationem, quae posthac ut poena post confessionem peccatori imponebatur, ut etiam nunc fit.

Hac ipsa aetate etiam ratio vocis paenitentiae scribendae mutari coepta est. Iam pridem, et frequenter inde a saeculo IV, in sermone vulgari diphthongus *ae* monophthongicam pronuntiationem *e* obtinuit; simili evolutione *oe* in *e* transit, quod inde ab aetate imperatoria probari potest. In pronuntiatione minus recta diphthongi *ae* litterae *ae* et *oe* in elocutione et scriptura in sonum *e* miscebantur. Sonus litterae *oe* in sermone vulgari (= *ö*) causa fuit, cur et ibi *oe* scriberetur, ubi sonus, qui antea fuit *ae* vel *e*, ad sonum *ö* accederet. Quae quidem ratio scribendi praecipue medii aevi propria erat et postea magis semper frequentabatur, sed hic illic iam in inscriptionibus aevi III et IV p. Chr. n. invenitur²⁾. Qui processus generalis etiam in voce „paenitentia” evaluasse videtur, et insuper hac re firmabatur, quod haec vox quod ad sensum attinet cum notione „poenae” coniungebatur.

1) Teeuwen, Bedeutungswandel bei Tertullian, p. 79; 89.

2) Kühner, Grammatik I (1912) p. 26, 8; 98, 5. Seelmann, Die Aussprache des Latein (1895) p. 227.

the subject of paenitentia-before-faith he completely leaves out the question of the actions of paenitentia (although such actions were not Pacting before baptism), but only discusses "improvement". When he returns to a discussion of second paenitentia, he only speaks about full confession, which is by all means something special, although other things also are required for the remission of sins. 1. Thus what "fear" is to the new convert, the actions of paenitentia are to the sinner, truly the most important point of paenitentia and just as in the former the notion of "paenitentia" expresses more the innermost spirit (or mind), so in the latter case it expresses especially outer (external) actions. Therefore just as the word "paenitentia" can fully signify "fear" in the new convert, so also it can signify the action of paenitentia in the sinner. It is used more often by Tertullien in this sense especially in the treatise "De pudicitia", in which he speaks only about second paenitentia, and deying (the power to grant) remission of sins to the church he attributes it to God alone, to whom paenitentia is done:2. Instead of full confession there he simply says "paenitentia".

In the treatise "De paenitentia" Tertullien also thinks that the forgiveness of all sins can be allowed in the name of paenitentia (although only once)3, and that he who has afterwards relapsed into capital sin, "loses paenitentia", that is he cannot be restored into communion. But in the treatise 'De pudicitia' he even writes that certain sins are irremissible, for which therefore all paenitentia seems to be vain, inasmuch as it does not bring forgiveness.4. Nevertheless even the sinner who cannot obtain forgiveness must do paenitentia. The church imposed this on him, not indeed because it believed that he would go into eternal damnation, but /

1."For what consequence follows from paenitentia other than improvement? but though forgiveness rather is the fruit of paenitentia, this also cannot be without the end of sinning. Thus the end of sinning is the root of/

to punish him as he deserved; for although "he does not reap peace here, he sows it in the fields of the Lord; he does not lose (his sin), but prepares the fruit" (i.e. forgiveness).....Thus paenitentia of this kind (= the punishment of this way of life and cult) is not in vain, nor is discipline of that kind harsh".

This notion of punishment (in Dutch boeta), which we saw from the beginning was in the word 'paenitentia', has remained linked to this word right up to our age. Therefore because that, which is called 'confession of sins' in our time, involved/contained especially the actions of paenitentia in the works of Tertullien, because of this the word "confession" was not used then to express this (as it now is) but the word "paenitentia". Since then from the age of Augustine public actions of paenitentia gradually disappeared, and more importance was attached to oral confession, then at last the word 'paeniteri' (to repent) became a technical term 1., and the word "paenitentia" indicated punishment, which was imposed on the sinner afterwards as a penalty after confession, as now happens.

In this very age the method of writing the word 'paenitentia' also began to change. Long ago, and then frequently from the fourth century, in common language the diphthong ae acquired the pronunciation of a single vowel e; by a similar evolution oe became e, which can be proved from the time of the Empire. In less correct pronunciation the diphthongs ae, the letters ae and oe are mixed up with the sound e in speaking and writing. The sound of the letters oe in common language (= δ) was the reason why it was also written oe there, when the sound which was previously oe or e approached (became like) the sound δ . This method of writing was especially characteristic of the middle ages, and afterwards was used more frequently, but it is found here and there in inscriptions of the third and fourth generations after Christ,2. This general process seems to have had an effect also on the word "paenitentia", and in addition was strengthened by this matter, because this word was linked with the notion of "poenae" (punishment) because it came near to its meaning.

1. /

1. /of forgiveness, so that forgiveness is the fruit of paenitentia" (pudic 10) Compare: "So that not only conscience is to be shown, but also the performance of some action" (paen. 9).
2. "We who remember that the Lord only pardons sins, especially mortal ones" (pudic 3).
3. "But new once, because new a second time, but never further, because it is nearly in vain (paen 7); "Therefore of this second and only paenitentia" (paen. 9).

1. Teeuwen, Bedeutungswandel bei Tertullien, p. 79; 89.
2. Kuhner, Grammatik I (1912) p.26 8, 98, 5. Seelmann, Die Aussprache des Latein (1885) p.227.